

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
84

A resolution of the City of Gainesville, Florida, approving and adopting City Auditor Responsibilities and Administrative Procedures; providing a repealing clause; and providing an immediate effective date.

WHEREAS, Resolution No. 970187 was adopted by the City Commission on August 11, 1997, for the purpose of clarifying and more precisely defining the procedures to be followed by the City Auditor in carrying out required responsibilities under the City Charter, and

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CITY COMMISSION OF THE
CITY OF GAINESVILLE, FLORIDA:**

CITY OF GAINESVILLE, FLORIDA

SECTION 1. Organizational Statute and Independence.

- 1

- 1
- 2 B. The City Commission recognizes that independence in fact and in appearance is an
- 3 essential precondition for the effective performance of the City Auditor's responsibilities
- 4 in conducting internal audits of City organizations, programs, functions and activities. It
- 5 is therefore adopted as a basic principle that the Office of the City Auditor shall be free of
- 6 any authority over its funding and administrative functions other than that exercised
- 7 directly by the City Commission.
- 8
- 9 C. The City Auditor shall have such assistants and employees as are necessary to perform
- 10 required duties and that are provided for by the City Commission. The personnel policies
- 11 and procedures to be followed shall be those of the City, except that the City Auditor
- 12 shall be the final administrative authority in personnel matters relating to the City
- 13 Auditor's Office, under the general supervision of and subject to the approval of the City
- 14 Commission.
- 15
- 16 D. Each year, in accordance with the schedule established for the preparation and
- 17 presentation to the City Commission of the City Manager's proposed budget, the City
- 18 Auditor shall prepare a budget proposal for the Office and present same to the Audit and
- 19 Finance Committee of the City Commission. Upon approval, the proposed budget will
- 20 be transmitted to the City Manager for inclusion without changes in the proposed City
- 21 Budget, and will be considered by the City Commission along with the proposed budgets
- 22 of all other City departments and Offices.
- 23
- 24 E. As a general rule, neither the City Auditor nor any member of the Office staff shall
- 25 conduct, supervise or otherwise participate in an audit of an activity for which they were
- 26 responsible or within which they were employed during the preceding two years.
- 27 However, such participation may be authorized by the City Commission when it has been
- 28 demonstrated to their satisfaction that such responsibility or employment would not
- 29 materially impair the objectivity and independence of the auditor.
- 30

31 **SECTION 2. Responsibility to Exercise Due Professional Care.**

- 32 A. In carrying out the required responsibilities, the City Auditor is to exercise due
- 33 professional care. This requires that the City Auditor perform duties in conformity with
- 34 Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards, making all reasonable efforts to
- 35 ensure that audit results are supported by factual information and impartial judgment.
- 36
- 37 B. This provision recognizes that the quality of audit results depends upon the degree to
- 38 which auditors employ high professional standards in performing their work and places
- 39 responsibility on the City Auditor for making reasonable efforts to ensure this is done. It
- 40 does not imply that the Office of the City Auditor or individual auditors accept unlimited
- 41 responsibility for disclosing impropriety, inefficiency, ineffectiveness or non-compliance.
- 42 Nor does it preclude inadvertent auditing errors from taking place.
- 43

1 C. To provide reasonable assurance that due professional care will be employed in
2 conducting audits, the City Auditor will establish audit standards, policies and procedures
3 and will ensure that these are followed by audit staff. These standards, policies and
4 procedures will be consistent with generally accepted professional practice and with
5 applicable laws and regulations.

6
7 D. *Government Auditing Standards* promulgated by the United States Government
8 Accountability Office require that each audit organization conducting audits in
9 accordance with these standards have an appropriate internal quality control system in
10 place and undergo an external peer review. Organizations conducting audits in
11 accordance with these standards should have an external peer review at least once every
12 three years by reviewers independent from the organization being reviewed. The external
13 peer review should determine whether the organization's internal quality control system
14 is suitably designed and operating effectively to provide reasonable assurance that
15 established policies and procedures and applicable auditing standards are being followed.
16 To provide assurance that the City Auditor's Office has fulfilled required responsibilities
17 and complied with *Government Auditing Standards*, the City Auditor will arrange for an
18 external peer review every three years. The firm or organization selected to perform the
19 review will be approved by the City Commission prior to the review and upon
20 completion, the results of the review will be reported in writing to the City Commission.
21 The external peer review process should include procedures designed to obtain input
22 from the other Charter Officers.

23
24 E. Investigations shall be conducted in accordance with the *Code of Professional Standards*
25 published by the Association of Certified Fraud Examiners.
26

27 **SECTION 3. Nature, Objective and Scope of Audit Work.**

28 A. The Office of the City Auditor is an independent appraisal activity within the City
29 organization for the review of operations as a service to the City Commission and City
30 management. Audit work carried out by the Office functions as a general control by
31 measuring and evaluating the effectiveness of other City controls.

32
33 B. The objective of audit work carried out by the Office is to assist all members of the City
34 Commission and City management in the effective discharge of their responsibilities by
35 furnishing them with analyses, appraisals, recommendations, counsel and information
36 concerning the activities reviewed.

37
38 C. The scope of audit work carried out by the Office may be concerned with any phase of
39 City activities where service may be rendered to the City Commission or to City
40 management. This involves going beyond the accounting and financial records to obtain
41 a full understanding of the operations under review, and involves such activities as:
42

- (1) Reviewing and appraising the soundness, adequacy, and application of accounting, financial, electronic data processing and other operating controls and promoting effective control at reasonable cost.
- (2) Ascertaining the extent of compliance with applicable laws and regulations and with established policies, plans and procedures.
- (3) Ascertaining the extent to which City assets are accounted for and safeguarded from losses of all kinds.
- (4) Ascertaining the sufficiency, validity and reliability of accounting and statistical data developed within the organization.
- (5) Appraising the economy, efficiency and effectiveness of City organizations, programs, functions and activities.
- (6) Recommending measures to the City Commission and City management for improving operations.

SECTION 4. Investigative Duties.

In carrying out investigative duties and responsibilities, the City Auditor shall initiate, conduct, supervise, and coordinate investigations designed to detect, deter, prevent, and eradicate fraud, waste, mismanagement, misconduct, and other abuses. For these purposes, the City Auditor shall:

- (a) Provide a Fraud, Waste, and Abuse reporting mechanism, otherwise known as a "hotline", that is available to employees, contractors, and citizens.
- (b) Receive complaints and coordinate all activities of the City as required by the Whistle-blower's Act pursuant to Sections 112.3187-112.31895, Florida Statutes.
- (c) Receive and consider the complaints which do not meet the criteria for an investigation under the Whistle-blower's Act and conduct, supervise, or coordinate such inquiries, investigations, or reviews as the City Auditor deems appropriate.

SECTION 5. Unlawful Conduct.

If the City Auditor discovers that unlawful conduct has occurred, or information that indicates occurrences of this nature may be reasonably anticipated, a decision will be made as to whether the issue results in a potential criminal offense. The City Auditor will temporarily suspend the audit or investigation, notify the City Attorney and the Chief of Police via the City Manager (or their written designee) requesting consideration of a criminal investigation. The City Auditor will provide, at the request of the Chief of Police, any technical and professional services necessary to assist in the criminal investigation. The portion of the engagement involving the criminal investigation will remain suspended until the criminal investigation is concluded. The Chief of Police and the City Attorney may also decide to notify the State Attorney in accordance with their requirements in conducting the investigation. When the investigation is concluded through issuance of an arrest warrant, finding that no criminal offense has taken place, or has

1 been determined not to be undertaken, the City Auditor shall resume the engagement and
2 promptly report the situation in writing concurrently to each member of the City Commission,
3 the City Attorney, and the appropriate Charter Officer. The Chief of Police will assist the City
4 Auditor in the audit by supplying all information which is not protected by State Statute.
5

6 **SECTION 6. Responsibilities for Planning.**

7 A. The City Auditor shall develop and submit to the City Commission for approval by
8 resolution a strategic plan, which shall cover a minimum of three years and a maximum
9 of five years. The strategic plan shall be based on the results of periodic risk assessments
10 and submitted to the City Commission every three years, three months following City
11 Commission acceptance and approval of the External Peer Review described in Section
12 2D. The strategic plan shall include, but shall not necessarily be limited to:

- 13
- 14 (1) a statement of general goals and objectives to be accomplished;
- 15 (2) major exposure areas;
- 16 (3) identification of major areas to be audited, and specification of the general nature
17 and timing of audit work in each area; and
- 18 (4) projected staffing requirements.
19

20 B. The City Auditor shall submit an Annual Audit Plan to the City Commission for approval
21 by resolution by October 1 of each fiscal year. The Annual Audit Plan shall identify each
22 audit to be conducted in terms of the organizations, programs, functions, and activities.
23 The audits identified in the Annual Audit Plan will be classified by type in accordance
24 with those specified in *Government Auditing Standards*, promulgated by the United
25 States General Accounting Office as follows:

- 26
- 27 (1) Financial Audits
28 Financial audits provide an independent assessment of whether an entity's
29 reported financial information such as financial condition, results, and use of
30 resources are presented fairly in accordance with recognized criteria. Financial
31 audits include financial statements audits and other related financial audits.
32
- 33 (2) Performance Audits
34 Performance audits provide findings or conclusions based on an evaluation of
35 sufficient, appropriate evidence against identified criteria. Performance audits
36 provide objective analysis to assist management and those charged with
37 governance and oversight in using the information to improve program
38 performance and operations, reduce costs, facilitate decision-making by parties
39 with responsibility to oversee or initiate corrective action, and contribute to public
40 accountability. Performance audits include government entities, organizations,
41 programs, activities and functions.
42
- 43 (3) Attestation Engagements

1 Attestation engagements cover a broad range of financial or nonfinancial
2 objectives on a subject matter or assertion that is the responsibility of another
3 party. An attestation engagement may be one of three types: Examination,
4 Review, or Agreed-Upon Procedures.

5
6 (4) Nonaudit Services

7 Nonaudit services are professional services such as an investigation of fraud,
8 waste, deficiencies, or abuse. Forecasting, evaluating, and analyzing alternative
9 plans may also be included as a nonaudit service.

- 10
11 C. The Annual Audit Plan may be amended during the year with the approval of the City
12 Commission.
13

14 **SECTION 7. Audit Requests by Charter Officers.**

15 A Charter Officer may request audits through the routine annual audit planning process.
16 Alternatively, a Charter Officer may request that the City Auditor conduct audits, special studies
17 or other activities which were not included in the Annual Audit Plan. If in the opinion of the
18 City Auditor, the request may have a significant impact on the Annual Audit Plan, such requests
19 will be presented to the City Commission by the City Auditor along with a recommendation as to
20 whether the audit should be undertaken. If approved by the City Commission, such audits will
21 be incorporated into the Annual Audit Plan. Upon completion of these services, the written
22 report documenting the results of the review will be issued to the requesting Charter Officer. In
23 accordance with the report processing procedures defined in Section 10 of this Resolution, the
24 requesting Charter Officer will provide a written response to the City Auditor regarding
25 recommendations made in the report. In the event there is disagreement between the City
26 Auditor and the Charter Officer receiving the requested services, the matter will be presented to
27 the Audit and Finance Committee for resolution. In any event the City Auditor will then inform
28 the City Commission in writing that a review has been performed and a written report is
29 available upon request.
30

31 **SECTION 8. Audit Coordination.**

32 A. In the selection of audit areas, the determination of audit scope, and the timing of audit
33 work, the City Auditor shall consult and cooperate with Federal and State auditors and
34 the City's external auditors so that desirable audit coverage is provided and audit effort
35 may be properly coordinated.
36

37 B. The City Auditor shall be responsible for coordinating all financial audits of the City
38 conducted by Federal auditors, State auditors, or certified public accounting firms.
39 Specifically, the City Auditor shall:
40

- 41 (1) In consultation with the Charter Officers, identify all audit requirements of the
42 City.

- (2) Recommend to the City Commission whether such audits should be conducted by the Office of the City Auditor or by external auditors.
 - (3) If the audit is to be conducted by external auditors, prepare a request for proposal (RFP) for Audit and Finance Committee approval in accordance with Florida Statutes and guidelines. The RFP will include evaluative criteria to be used in rating proposals.
 - (4) Prepare a list of firms to receive the RFP for Audit and Finance Committee approval.
 - (5) Transmit, receive, evaluate and rate all proposals.
 - (6) Refer the ratings to the Audit and Finance Committee for evaluation, rating and preparation of a recommendation to the City Commission of the firm to be selected.
 - (7) Assist the City Attorney in drafting a contract which ensures that the firm selected is bound to fulfill the requirements of the audit.
 - (8) Monitor the progress of the audit and report regularly to the City Commission on the progress of the audit.
 - (9) During the course of the audit, advise City management in dealing with any questions or concerns that may arise.
 - (10) Receive the final audit report after the opinion has been signed, review the report to ensure that contractual terms have been fulfilled, and transmit the report to the City Commission with a recommendation for acceptance or rejection. In some cases, the law may require that the audit report be submitted directly to the federal grantor agency. In such cases, the City Auditor will comply with applicable law and will inform the City Commission of the action taken.
 - (11) Based on a review of the audit report and any accompanying auditor communications, recommend to the City Commission and City management any actions necessary to correct deficiencies in internal control, accounting procedures or compliance with applicable laws and regulations.
- C. The Charter Officers shall ensure that all audit requirements for programs under their authority are made known to the City Auditor in time for the City Auditor to carry out required responsibilities for audit coordination, and they shall inform the City Auditor of any notification received of audits to be conducted by Federal or State auditors. In addition, the financial statements remain the representation of management, and it therefore remains management's responsibility to ensure that they are prepared properly and to work with any contract auditors, Federal auditors, or State auditors on a day-to-day basis to provide the accounting records and other information necessary for the examination.

SECTION 9. Audit Reports to the City Commission.

- A. The City Auditor shall prepare a written report of the results of each audit conducted by the Office.
- B. The City Auditor shall submit each report to the City Commission, or notification that a report has been issued as described under the agreed upon circumstances described in

1 Section 7, shall file a copy with the Clerk of the Commission, and shall retain a copy in
2 the Office as a permanent record.

3
4 C. If appropriate, the audit report shall contain the professional opinion of the City Auditor
5 or the contract auditor concerning the financial statements issued by the audited entity,
6 or, if an opinion cannot be expressed, then a declaration to that effect with an
7 explanation.

8
9 D. The City Auditor shall include in each audit report:

- 10
11 (1) a statement of the scope of the audit work performed;
12 (2) a statement of all audit findings and recommendations for desirable action; and
13 (3) a response addressing the audit findings and recommendations submitted by the
14 appropriate Charter Officer or in cases where the audited entity is not under the
15 authority of a Charter Officer, by the highest official of the audited entity.
16

17 **SECTION 10. Report Processing Procedures.**

18
19 A. Upon completion of the final draft of an audit report, and prior to submission of the
20 report to the City Commission, the City Auditor shall transmit the preliminary findings
21 and recommendations to management of the audited entity and to other appropriate
22 officials for review.

23
24 B. Within two weeks (2) after receiving the report, the appropriate Charter Officer or other
25 appropriate official will prepare an official written response to the findings and
26 recommendations contained within the report and transmit the response to the City
27 Auditor.

28
29 C. The official response will address each recommendation presented in the audit report and
30 will specify whether the recommendation is:

- 31
32 (1) accepted;
33 (2) partially accepted; or
34 (3) rejected.
35

36 In the first two cases, the date of implementation or the date when implementation is expected
37 will be specified. In the third case, the response will include an explanation of why the
38 recommendation is rejected.
39

40 D. The official written response will be included verbatim in the audit report issued to the
41 City Commission by the City Auditor.

42
43 E. In cases where the complexity or timing of the audit report creates circumstances which
44 render the two week response time unreasonable, the City Auditor may extend the
45 response deadline by a reasonable amount of time. If no response is received within the

1 appropriate timeframe from the transmittal of the report to officials of the audited entity,
2 the City Auditor will issue the audit report without the response unless a further extension
3 of the deadline is granted by the City Commission.
4

5 **SECTION 11. Responsibilities for Evaluating Corrective Actions on Prior Audits.**

6
7 Corrective follow-up is the action taken to correct a weak control situation that has been
8 identified by the auditor and reported to management. The initial responsibility for corrective
9 follow-up action is clearly that of management and those charged with governance. If
10 management fails to take action or subordinates fail to implement prior recommendations, the
11 City Auditor's Office has a responsibility to report that situation.

12
13 The timing of the City Auditor's follow-up will depend on a variety of factors. For instance, if
14 the recommendations result from the audit of an area that receives an annual audit, follow-up can
15 be done during the following annual audit. For recommendations that require immediate
16 attention, a follow-up of 30 days may be appropriate. In general, the City Auditor will adhere to
17 the following system for follow-up on outstanding audit recommendations:

- 18
19 (1) Upon approval of the City Auditor's original report and management's response
20 by the City Commission, the recommendations and expected date of
21 implementation are recorded. On an annual basis the City Auditor will follow-up
22 with management on the status of open recommendations.
23 (2) The responsible management official will provide a written status report to the
24 appropriate Charter Officer who will report the recommendation status to the City
25 Auditor.
26 (3) Upon notification that corrective action has been taken to implement the
27 recommendation, the City Auditor will take the necessary steps to verify that
28 corrective action has been taken.
29

30 The City Auditor will provide an annual report to the Audit and Finance Committee listing the
31 status of outstanding recommendations.
32

33 **SECTION 12. Public Records.**

34 Section 119.0713(2), Florida Statutes, provides an exemption related to local government audits
35 and investigations. Specifically, the audit report of an internal auditor and the investigative
36 report of the inspector general becomes a public record when the audit or investigation becomes
37 final. An audit or investigation becomes final when the audit report or investigative report is
38 presented to the unit of local government. Audit workpapers and notes related to such audit and
39 information received, produced, or derived from an investigation are confidential and exempt
40 from public record until the audit or investigation is complete and the audit report becomes final
41 or when the investigation is no longer active. An investigation is active if it is continuing with a
42 reasonable, good faith anticipation of resolution and with reasonable dispatch.
43

1 The City Auditor shall retain for at least the period of time required under Florida Public Records
2 Law, a complete file of each audit report and each report of other examinations, investigations,
3 surveys, and reviews made under the City Auditor's authority. The file should include audit
4 workpapers and other supportive material directly pertaining to the report.
5

6 **SECTION 13. Budget Reviews.**

- 7 A. Each year, subsequent to the submission of the proposed City budget to the City
8 Commission by the City Manager, the City Auditor shall review the General Fund
9 revenue estimates included in the proposed budget. Upon completion of the review, the
10 City Auditor shall transmit to the City Commission a memorandum stating whether in the
11 City Auditor's opinion the revenue estimates were prepared using data and methods
12 which provide reasonable assurance that the projected amount of revenue will be
13 realized.
14
- 15 B. Upon the request of the City Commission, the City Auditor shall review other selected
16 portions of the proposed budget submitted to the City Commission by the Charter
17 Officers. Such reviews will be conducted according to priorities set by the City
18 Commission.
19

20 **SECTION 14. Access to Records and Property.**

21 All officers and employees of the City shall furnish to the City Auditor any information, data,
22 and other records within their custody and respond to any questions regarding powers, duties,
23 activities, organization, property, financial transactions and methods of business that in the City
24 Auditor's opinion are required to conduct an audit and to perform the requisite duties. Further,
25 they shall provide access for the City Auditor to inspect all City property, equipment and
26 facilities within their custody and to observe any operations for which they are responsible.
27 Access shall include readily available user accounts for all information technology programs,
28 databases, software applications and other electronic information storage assets.
29

30 The City Auditor shall be made aware of all audits performed by internal or external parties at
31 the earliest stage of planning or contracting for audit, attestation, or investigative services
32 (excluding criminal investigations by the Gainesville Police Department or other law
33 enforcement agencies).
34

35 **SECTION 15. Contract Auditors, Consultants and Experts.**

36
37 Upon approval of the City Commission, the City Auditor may obtain the services of certified
38 public accountants, qualified management consultants, or other professional experts necessary to
39 assist the City Auditor in the performance of required duties.
40

1 **Section 2.** Resolution No. 970187 is hereby repealed. In addition, all resolutions or parts
2 of resolutions in conflict herewith are to the extent of such conflict hereby repealed.

3 **Section 3.** This resolution shall become effective immediately upon adoption.
4

5 **PASSED AND ADOPTED** this 4th day of February, 2016.
6

7
8 
9 EDWARD B. BRADDY
10 MAYOR

11
12 Attest:

13 
14 KURT M. LANNON
15 CLERK OF THE COMMISSION
16
17

Approved as to form and legality:

18 APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY
19  2/4/16
20 Sean M. McDermott
21 Assistant City Attorney
22 NICOLLE M. SHALLEY
23 CITY ATTORNEY